

FIRST

REPORT
FROM

The Public Administration and
Appropriations Committee

EXAMINATION
OF

First Report of the PAAC - A summary of inquiries
undertaken during the Eleventh Parliament for
the period 2015-2020

Office of the Parliament
Parliamentary Complex
Cabildo Building
St. Vincent Street Port of Spain
Republic of Trinidad and Tobago



Public Administration and Appropriations Committee

The Public Administration and Appropriations Committee (PAAC) is established by Standing Order 102 and 92 of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively. The Committee is mandated to consider and report to Parliament on:

- (a) *the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies to ensure that expenditure is embarked upon in accordance with parliamentary approval;*
- (b) *the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies as it occurs and keeps Parliament informed of how the budget allocation is being implemented; and*
- (c) *the administration of Government agencies to determine hindrances to their efficiency and to make recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration.*

Membership

Mrs. Bridgid Mary Annisette-George	Chairman
Dr. Lackram Bodoie	Vice-Chairman
Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Member
Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Member
Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Member
Mr. Daniel Dookie	Member
Mr. Wade Mark	Member
Brig. Gen. (Ret.) Ancil Antoine	Member
Ms. Amrita Deonarine	Member
Mr. Foster Cummings	Member

Committee Staff

The staff members serving the Committee are:

Ms. Keiba Jacob	Secretary to the Committee
Ms. Sheranne Samuel	Assistant Secretary
Ms. Hema Bhagaloo	Assistant Secretary
Ms. Rachel Nunes	Graduate Research Assistant
Ms. Ashaki Alexis	Graduate Research Assistant
Ms. Anesha James	Administrative Support
Ms. Natoya O'Neil	Administrative Support

Publication

An electronic copy of this report can be found on the Parliament website using the following link:

http://www.ttparliament.org/committee_business.php?mid=19&id=232&pid=28

Contact Information All correspondence should be addressed to:

The Secretary
Public Administration and Appropriations Committee
Office of the Parliament
Parliamentary Complex
Cabildo Building
St. Vincent Street, Port of Spain
Republic of Trinidad and Tobago
Tel: (868) 624-7275 Ext 2372, 2373; 2409, 2372 Fax: (868) 625-4672
Email: paac@ttparliament.org

Date Laid in HOR: November 10, 2021

Date Laid in Senate: November 16, 2021

Table of Contents

FIRST	1
Public Administration and Appropriations Committee	2
Members of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee	8
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	9
1. INTRODUCTION	10
THE COMMITTEE	10
Change in Membership	10
METHODOLOGY	12
2. REVIEW OF THE PAAC IN THE 11TH PARLIAMENT	14
Summary of Reports	14
Follow-up Inquiries	34
Pervasive Issues	38
3. CONCLUSION	41
APPENDIX 1	42
Attendance Register	42
Meetings	43
First Meeting	43
27.01.2016	43
Second Meeting	43
10.02.2016	43
Third Meeting	43
24.02.2016	43
Fourth Meeting	43
21.03.2016	43
Fifth Meeting	43
13.04.2016	43
Sixth Meeting	43
27.04.2016	43
Seventh Meeting	43
11.05.2016	43

Eight Meeting.....	43
08.06.2016	43
Meetings	44
Ninth Meeting	44
15.06.2016	44
Tenth Meeting	44
22.06.2016	44
Eleventh Meeting	44
13.07.2016	44
Twelfth Meeting	44
15.09.2016	44
Thirteenth Meeting	44
16.11.2016.....	44
Fourteenth Meeting	44
30.11.2016.....	44
Fifteenth	44
Meeting.....	44
14.12.2016.....	44
Meetings	45
Sixteenth Meeting	45
12.01.2017.....	45
Seventeenth	45
Meeting.....	45
25.01.2017	45
Eighteenth Meeting	45
08.02.2017	45
Nineteenth	45
Meeting.....	45
15.02.2017	45
Twentieth Meeting.....	45
08.03.2017	45

Twenty- First.....	45
Meeting.....	45
23.03.2017	45
Twenty-Second Meeting	45
20.04.2017	45
Meetings	46
Twenty-Third Meeting	46
27.04.2017	46
Twenty-Fourth Meeting.....	46
05.06.2017	46
Twenty-Fifth Meeting 03.07.2017.....	46
Twenty-Sixth Meeting 11.09.2017	46
Twenty- Seventh.....	46
Meeting.....	46
13.12.2017.....	46
Twenty- Eighth	46
Meeting.....	46
28.12.2017	46
Twenty- Ninth	46
Meeting.....	46
17.1.2018.....	46
Thirtieth.....	46
Meeting.....	46
31.1.2018.....	46
Meetings	47
Thirty – First	47
Meeting.....	47
31.02.2018	47
Thirty- Second	47
Meeting.....	47
28.02.2018.....	47

Thirty- Third Meeting	47
18.04.2018	47
Thirty-Fourth	47
Meeting.....	47
25.04.2018	47
Thirty-Fifth Meeting.....	47
09.05.2018	47
Thirty-Sixth Meeting	47
16.05.2018	47
Thirty- Seventh	47
Meting.....	47
13.06.2018	47
Thirty- Eight	47
Meeting.....	47
11.07.2018.....	47
Thirty-Ninth Meeting.....	47
25.09.2018	47
Meetings	48
Fortieth	48
Meeting.....	48
09.01.2019	48
Forty- First Meeting.....	48
23.01.2019	48
Forty- Second Meeting	48
13.02.2019	48
Forty- Third Meeting.....	48
20.02.2019	48
Forty- Fourth.....	48
Meeting.....	48
13.03.2019	48
Forty- Fifth	48

Meeting.....	48
28.03.2019	48
Meetings	49
Forty- Sixth.....	49
Meeting.....	49
10.04.2019	49
Forty- Seventh Meeting	49
22.05.2019	49
Forty- Eight.....	49
Meeting.....	49
29.05.2019	49
Forty- Ninth Meeting	49
18.09.2019	49
Meetings	50
Fiftieth Meeting.....	50
13.11.2019	50
Fifty- First Meeting	50
05.02.2020.....	50
Fifty-Second Meeting	50
12.02.2020	50
Fifty-Third Meeting	50
11.03.2020	50
Fifty-Fourth Meeting	50
21.05.2020	50

Members of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee



Mrs. Bridgid Mary Annisette-George
Chairman



Dr. Lackram Bodoie
Vice-Chairman



Mr. Wade Mark
Member



Mr. Clarence Rambharat
Member



Mrs. Ayanna
Webster-Roy
Member



Brig. Gen. (Ret.) Ancil Antoine
Member



Ms. Amrita Deonarine
Member



Mr. Daniel Dookie
Member



Ms. Nicole Olivierre
Member



Mr. Foster Cummings
Member

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report of the PAAC contains the details of work undertaken by the Committee for the 11th Parliament.

The objective of the Committee throughout the 11th Parliament was to expand its work not only in the area of appropriations of funds but the public administration aspect. The Committee in undertaking its examinations of Ministries, Departments and State Enterprises ensured the following areas were scrutinized:

- Inventory Control;
- Internal Audit;
- Accountability and Transparency;
- Monitoring and Evaluation;
- Fraud;
- Staffing; and
- Projects and Programmes.

The administration of the entities appearing before the Committee was an important area of focus during the 11th Parliament. The approach adopted by the Committee took into account issues identified from responses received and reports in the media. A summary of the Committee's deliberations is presented in below.

1. INTRODUCTION

THE COMMITTEE

The Public Administration and Appropriations Committee (PAAC) is established by Standing Order (S.O.) 102 and 92 of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively. The Committee is mandated to consider and report to Parliament on:

- a) the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies to ensure that expenditure is embarked upon in accordance with parliamentary approval;
- b) the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies as it occurs and keeps Parliament informed of how the budget allocation is being implemented; and
- c) the administration of Government agencies to determine hindrances to their efficiency and to make recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration.

Change in Membership

1. In the 11th Parliament the Members of the Committee were appointed by resolutions of the House of Representatives and the Senate at sittings held on Friday, November 13, 2015, and Tuesday, November 17, 2015, respectively. The Committee comprised of:
 - Mrs. Bridgid Mary Annisette-George Chairman
 - Dr. Lackram Bodoe Vice-Chairman
 - Ms. Nicole Olivierre
 - Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy
 - Mr. Clarence Rambharat
 - Mr. Daniel Dookie
 - Mr. Wade Mark
 - Brig. Gen. (Ret.) Ancil Antoine
 - Ms. Amrita Deonarine
 - Mr. Foster Cummings
2. By resolution of the Senate on November 3, 2017, Ms. Jennifer Raffoul was appointed as a Member of the Committee in lieu of Dr. Dhanayshar Mahabir.

3. By resolution of the House of Representatives on November 24, 2017, Brigadier General (Ret.) Ancil Antoine was appointed as a Member of the Committee in lieu of Mr. Maxie Cuffie.
4. By resolution of the Senate on November 28, 2017, Mr. Ronald Huggins was appointed as a Member of the Committee in lieu of Ms. Allyson Baksh.
5. By resolution of the Senate on November 27, 2018, Mr. Garvin Simonette was appointed as a Member of the Committee in lieu of Mr. Ronald Huggins.
6. By resolution of the Senate on November 27, 2018, Ms. Amrita Deonarine was appointed as a Member of the Committee in lieu of Ms. Jennifer Raffoul.
7. By resolution of the Senate on October 25, 2019, Mr. Foster Cummings was appointed as a Member of the Committee in lieu of Mr. Garvin Simonette.

Chairman & Vice-Chairman

By virtue of S.O. 109(6) and 99(6) of the House of Representatives and the Senate respectively, the Chairman of the Committee is the Speaker and at its First Meeting held on January 27, 2016, Dr. Lackram Bodoë was elected the Vice-Chairman.

Quorum

Additionally, in order to exercise the powers granted to it by the House, the Committee was required by the Standing Orders to have a quorum. A quorum of three (3) Members, inclusive of the Chairman or Vice-Chairman, with representatives from both Houses, was agreed to by the Committee at its First Meeting.

METHODOLOGY

Determination of the Committee's Work Programme

At the beginning of each session the Committee's Work Programme was determined.

In undertaking inquiries during the 11th Parliament, the Committee employed three (3) mechanisms:

- i. Written Submissions;
- ii. Public Hearings; and
- iii. Site Visits.

Review of Documents

The Committee deliberated on the following documents, namely:

- i. Budget Documents;
- ii. Auditor-General Reports;
- iii. Monthly Statements of Expenditure of Minsitries and Departments;
- iv. Ministerial Responses; and
- v. Current news.

The Inquiry Process

The Inquiry Process outlines steps taken by the Committee when conducting an inquiry into an entity or issue. The following steps outline the Inquiry process followed by the PAAC during the 11th Parliament :

1. Identification of entity to be examined;
2. Preparation of Inquiry Proposal for the selected entity. The Inquiry Proposal outlines:
 - i. Description
 - ii. Background;
 - iii. Overview of Expenditure
 - iv. Rationale/Objective of Inquiry; and
 - v. Proposed Questions.

3. Consideration and approval of Inquiry Proposals by the Committee and when approved, questions are forwarded to the entity for written responses;
4. Issue of requests for written comment from the public are made via Parliament's website, social media accounts, newspaper and advertisements;
5. Preparation of an Issues Paper by the Secretariat for the Committee's consideration, based on written responses received from the entities. The Issues Paper identifies and summarises any matters of concern in the responses provided by the entity or received from stakeholders and the general public;
6. Review of the responses provided and the Issues Paper by the Committee;
7. Conduct of a site visit to obtain a first-hand perspective of the implementation of a project (optional);
8. Determination of the need for a Public Hearing based on the analysis of written submissions and the site visit (if required). If there is need for a Public Hearing, the relevant witnesses will be invited to attend and provide evidence. There is usually no need to examine the entity in public if the Committee believes the issues have little public interest or the Committee believes that the written responses provided are sufficient and no further explanation is necessary.
9. Issue of written request to the entity for further details should the Committee require any additional information after the Public Hearing.
10. Report Committee's findings and recommendations to Parliament upon conclusion of the inquiry.
11. Engage in follow-up.

2. REVIEW OF THE PAAC IN THE 11TH PARLIAMENT

Summary of Reports

First Session

1. **The First Report¹ of the PAAC on the examination into the Current Expenditure of Ministries and Departments under three (3) Sub-Heads: Current Transfers and Subsidies, Development Programme – Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund was laid in the House of Representatives (HOR) on September 9,2016 and Senate on September 15, 2016**

The PAAC conducted an extensive omnibus examination into the current public expenditure of thirty-two (32) Ministries and Departments (M&Ds) under three (3) Sub-Heads:

- Good and Services;
- Current Transfers and Subsidies; and
- Development Programme – Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund.

During the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions, Public Hearings and site visits, the Committee discovered a number of pervasive issues such as Internal Audit, Monitoring and Evaluation and the Exclusion of Projects from the PSIP. The prevalence of these issues, hinders the efficiency of the M&Ds and these were matters the Committee hopes to examine/investigate further. The Committee also discovered specific issues relevant to each M&D. The Committee proposed recommendations for greater accountability, transparency and value for money in the use of public funds under the three (3) Sub-Heads.

¹ Office of the Parliament website, *First Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20161109, 1st Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee - Wednesday November 9, 2016 \(tparliament.org\)](http://tparliament.org)

Second Session

1. The Second Report² of the PAAC on the examination of the Expenditure and Internal Controls of the Office of the President (OTP) was laid in the HOR on May 5, 2017 and Senate on May 2, 2017

The PAAC conducted an examination into the current public expenditure and internal control policies of the OTP under the following areas:

- Inventory Control;
- Internal Audit;
- Accountability and Transparency;
- Goods and Services; and
- Minor Equipment Purchases.

During the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions and Public Hearings, the Committee discovered a number of issues related to:

- Inventory Control;
- Internal Audit;
- Accountability and Transparency;
- Contract Employment;
- Official Overseas Travel and Hosting of Conferences, Seminars; and
- Other Functions at the Department.

The prevalence of these issues, hinders the efficiency of the Department and these were matters the Committee hopes to examine/investigate further.

Overall, the Committee was not satisfied with the Internal Control mechanisms at the OTP. The Committee was of the view that as a small Department it was important for critical stakeholder agencies in the Public Service to pay closer attention to the operations and functions of the Department. The Permanent Secretary in the Ministry of Finance (MOF) and the Comptroller of Accounts have a responsibility to closely monitor small Departments and provide support and advice to the Accounting Officer where necessary. The Committee

² Office of the Parliament website, *Second Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: <http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s2-J-20170502-PAAC-r2.pdf>

proposed recommendations for greater accountability, transparency and efficiency within the Department.

2. The Third Report³ of the PAAC on the examination of the System of Inventory Control Within the Public Service was laid in the HOR on May 5, 2017 and Senate on May 2, 2017

The PAAC conducted an examination into the System of Inventory Control within the Public Service. During the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions and Public Hearings, the Committee discovered a number of issues regarding:

- Procurement and Disposal of Assets;
- Inventory Control Management;
- the lack of a Policy for the Acquisition and Use of Motor Vehicles, the Exchequer and Audit Act and the Financial Regulations, Public Service Vacancies/Establishing Positions and Offices; and
- Training of Public Service officials.

The Committee believes that the prevalence of these issues, hinders the efficiency, accountability and transparency of M&Ds and these were matters the Committee would like to examine/investigate further. The Committee was hopeful the adoption of its proposed recommendations would lead to the overall improvement of the Inventory Control System within the Public Service.

3. The Fourth Report⁴ of the PAAC on the examination of the System of Internal Audit Within The Public Service was laid in the HOR on September 15, 2017 and Senate on September 14, 2017

The PAAC conducted an examination into the System of Internal Audit within the Public Service. During the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions and Public Hearings, the Committee discovered a number of issues such as:

³ Office of the Parliament website, *Third Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: <http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s2-J-20170502-PAAC-r3.pdf>

⁴ Office of the Parliament website, *Fourth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20170915, Fourth Report of the PAAC - Examination of the System of Internal Audit Within The Public Service \(ttparliament.org\)](http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s2-J-20170915-PAAC-r4.pdf)

- the failure to fill Internal Audit Vacancies;
- inefficient Internal Audit Checks;
- inadequate Internal Audit Qualifications; and
- insufficient training of Internal Audit Staff within the Internal Audit Unit Performing other Administrative Functions.

The prevalence of these issues, hinders the efficiency accountability and transparency of M&Ds and these are matters the Committee hopes to examine/investigate further. The Committee is hopeful the adoption of its proposed recommendations would lead to the overall improvement of the system of Internal Audit within the Public Service..

4. The Fifth Report⁵ of the PAAC on the examination into the Ministry of Housing and Urban Development (MHUD) with specific reference to Accountability and Transparency, Inventory Control, Internal Audit, Sub - Head 02 - Goods and Services, Sub - Head 03 - Minor Equipment Purchases, Sub – Head 09 Development Programme – Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund was laid in the HOR on September 15, 2017 and Senate on September 14, 2017

The PAAC conducted an examination into the MHUD with particular reference to:

- Inventory Control;
- Internal Audit;
- Sub - Head 02 - Goods and Services;
- Sub - Head 03 - Minor Equipment Purchases;
- Head 04 - Current Transfers and Subsidies; and
- Sub – Head 09 Development Programme – Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund.

During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee discovered a number of issues such as:

- an ineffective Inventory Control and Internal Audit System;
- the non-existence of a Monitoring and Evaluation Unit;

⁵ Office of the Parliament website, *Fifth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee* , accessed on August 16,2021: <http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s2-J-20170915-PAAC-R5.pdf>

- the lack of the necessary training required for staff;
- a significant indebtedness owed by the public to an agency under its purview;
- poor revenue collection methods; and
- outstanding financial statements, among other concerns.

The Committee intends to continuously monitor the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

5. The Sixth Report⁶ of the PAAC Examination into the Tobago House of Assembly with specific reference to Accountability and Transparency, Inventory Control, Internal Audit, Sub - Head 02- Goods and Services, Sub - Head 03 Minor Equipment Purchases, Head 04 - Current Transfers and Subsidies and Sub- Head 09 Development Programme – Consolidated Fund was laid in the HOR December 15, 2017 and Senate on January 23, 2018

The PAAC conducted an examination into the Tobago House of Assembly with specific reference to Accountability and Transparency, Inventory Control, Internal Audit, Sub - Head 02- Goods and Services, Sub - Head 03 - Minor Equipment Purchases, Head 04 - Current Transfers and Subsidies and Sub- Head 09 Development Programme – Consolidated Fund. During the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee discovered a number of issues such as:

- weak Inventory Control and Internal Audit systems;
- lack of a risk register; and
- absence of Monitoring and Evaluation Units.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations would strengthen the monitoring and evaluation of its operations and lead to greater efficiencies at the Assembly..

⁶ Office of the Parliament website, *Sixth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: <http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s3-J-20171215-PAAC-R6.pdf>

6. The Seventh Report⁷ of the PAAC on the examination into the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs with specific reference to Follow-up to the First Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee and Current Expenditure Related to Official Travel to Tobago was laid on the HOR on January 12, 2018 and Senate on Janaury 16, 2018

The PAAC conducted a follow-up examination into the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs (MSYA) with regard to the First Report of the PAAC on an Examination into the Current Expenditure of Ministries and Departments under three (s) Sub-Heads: Current Transfers and Subsidies, Development Programme - Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund, in addition to a look at the Ministry's current expenditure for fiscal year 2017 with specific reference to official travel to Tobago.

Throughout the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues emanating from the First Report such as:

- short-term employment;
- maintenance plans;
- refurbishment and upgrade of multi-purpose stadia; and
- site visits.

The Committee also treated specifically with an issue which was in the public domain relating to official travel to Tobago and accountability and transparency. The Committee intends to continuously monitor the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

7. The Eighth Report⁸ of the PAAC on the examination into the Ministry of Education with specific reference to Inventory Control, Internal Audit, Sub-Head 02 - Goods and Services, Sub-Head 03 - Minor Equipment Purchases, Sub-Head 04 - Current Transfers and Subsidies, Sub-Head 09 Development Programme – Consolidated Fund and

⁷ Office of the Parliament website, *Seventh Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021:

⁸ Office of the Parliament website, *Eighth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: <http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s3-J-20180112-PAAC-R8.pdf>

Infrastructure Development Fund was laid in the HOR on Jnaaury 12, 2018 and in the Senate on Jnauary 16, 2018

The PAAC conducted an examination into the Ministry of Education (MOE) with specific reference to Inventory Control, Internal Audit, Sub - Head 02 - Goods and Services, Sub - Head 03 - Minor Equipment Purchases, Head 04 - Current Transfers and Subsidies, Sub – Head 09 Development Programme – Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund. During the course of the examination which comprised of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee discovered a number of issues such as:

- weak Inventory Control and Internal Audit systems;
- significant indebtedness to the National Maintenance Training and Security Company Limited (MTS);
- understaffed Monitoring and Evaluation Unit;
- absence of a Monitoring and Evaluation Framework;
- noncompliance by Heads of Divisions, over one thousand (1000) vacancies; and
- late payment of scholarship allowances.

The Committee proposed recommendations and intends to continuously monitor the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

Third Session

8. The Interim Report⁹ of the PAAC on the examination into the Processing of Payment of Pension and Gratuity to Retired Public Officers and Contracted Employees was laid in the HOR on September 9, 2019 and Senate on September 20, 2019

Based on the evidence received the Committee intends to monitor the progress subsequent to the implementation of the recommendations by the entities as proposed in this report. The Committee is hopeful the adoption of its proposed recommendations would lead to the improvement of the processing of pensions and gratuities. A follow up inquiry was conducted in the following session.

⁹ Office of the Parliament website, *Interim Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20181109, Interim Report of the PAAC - Pensions and Gratuities \(tparliament.org\)](https://tparliament.org/20181109/Interim-Report-of-the-PAAC-Pensions-and-Gratuities)

9. The Eleventh Report¹⁰ of the PAAC on Examination of the Ministry of Public Administration and Communications (MPAC) with regard to Accountability and Transparency, Merger of both Ministries, Ministerial responses to Third Report on Inventory Control and Fourth Report on Internal Audit, Sub-Head 02 - Goods and Services, Sub-Head 09 Development Programme Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund for the Financial Year 2018 was laid in the HOR on November 11, 2018 and Senate on November 20, 2018

The PAAC conducted an examination into the Ministry of Public Administration and Communications with particular reference to the Accountability and Transparency, Recurrent Expenditure, Development Programme – Consolidated Fund, Infrastructure Development Fund, recommendations from the PAAC’s Third Report on Inventory Control, Fourth Report on Internal Audit and the Ministry’s Monthly Expenditure Report for the period October – December 2017.

Throughout the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues such as:

- responses received from the Ministry;
- the merging of the Ministry,
- the Auditor General’s Report 2016; and
- the implementation of recommendations of the Committee.

The Committee also delved into issues relating to outreach to tertiary level students, reliance of contract employment, training for Public Officers and the lack of ICT Security Policy and ICT Strategic Plan.

Additionally, the realignment of Ministry in 2018, was a source of concern for the Committee given the issues which arose due to the merger such as the maintenance of assets the processing

¹⁰ Office of the Parliament website, *Eleventh Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20181109, Eleventh Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee - Ministry of Public Administration and Communications \(tparliament.org\)](https://tparliament.org/20181109/Eleventh-Report-of-the-Public-Administration-and-Appropriations-Committee-Ministry-of-Public-Administration-and-Communications)

of pension and leave. Any progress that was made since the realignment in 2015 would now be undone and a period of adjustment would be needed.

The Committee was of the view that every effort should be made to mitigate any adverse effects of the change while ensuring that both Ministries continue to function effectively and efficiently. The Committee was hopeful the adoption of its proposed recommendations would lead to greater improvement in the system of Internal Audit and Inventory Control.

10. The Twelfth Report¹¹ of the PAAC on the examination into the Administration of Disaster relief in Trinidad and Tobago was laid in the HOR on December 17, 2018 and Senate December 19, 2018

The PAAC conducted an examination into the Administration of Disaster Relief in Trinidad and Tobago. During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and two (2) Public Hearings, the Committee followed up on a number of issues from the responses received from stakeholders.

During the course of the examinations the Committee discovered that the stakeholders were experiencing difficulties with regard to:

- staffing;
- sensitization of the public;
- insufficient funds for natural disasters; and
- lack of policies to promote efficiency and effectiveness.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater efficiency and effectiveness in the administration of disaster relief and also stronger more coordinated responses in the event of disasters.

¹¹ Office of the Parliament website, *Twelfth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20181217, Twelfth \(12th\) Report of the PAAC - Administration of Disaster Relief \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20181217/Twelfth%20(12th)%20Report%20of%20the%20PAAC%20-%20Administration%20of%20Disaster%20Relief)

11. The Thirteenth Report¹² of the PAAC on the An examination into the Administration of Special Health Care Programmes in Trinidad and Tobago was laid in the HOR on Janaury 11, 2019 and Senate on January 15, 2019

The PAAC conducted an inquiry into the Ministry of Health (MOH) with particular reference to the Administration of Special Health Care Programmes. During the course of the examination, the Committee noted the lack of controls to monitor Special Health Care programmes offered to the citizens of Trinidad and Tobago. Additionally, the Committee observed that there were

- a lack of public awareness of the programmes offered to patients in the public health care system;
- a decrease in new cases of HIV/AIDS; and
- an increase in patients suffering from Cardiac Disease.

The Committee emphasises that in the context of the Non-Communicable Disease (NCD) epidemic as described by the MOH and the multi-year, multi-million dollar loan accessed by the Government of Trinidad and Tobago to deal with NCDs, the MOH should work with counterpart Ministries like the MOE, Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Fisheries (MALF), Ministry of Trade and Industry (MTI), Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs (MSYA) and Ministry of Social Development Family Services (MSDFS) to embark on a public awareness campaign on NCDs within the current NCD prevention and control plan introduced in 2017.

The Committee also emphasizes that in the context of the need to strengthen its oversight functions and its capacity to monitor Regional Health Authority's (RHAs) in Trinidad and Tobago, RHA's must ensure the timely preparation and submission of reports to the MOH and other relevant authorities. Finally, the Committee was of the view that the adoption of its recommendations contained in this report would lead to greater accountability and oversight in the use of public funds and greater efficiencies in the administration of Special Health Care Programmes.

¹² Office of the Parliament website, *Thirteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20190111, Thirteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee - Administration of Special Health Care Programmes \(tparliament.org\)](http://tparliament.org)

12. The Fourteenth Report¹³ of the PAAC on the examination into the Construction, Maintenance and Refurbishment of State-Owned or State-Funded Housing Projects and Units was laid in the HOR on January 11, 2019 and Senate on January 15, 2019

The PAAC conducted an inquiry into the Construction, Maintenance and Refurbishment of State- Owned or State-Funded Housing Projects and Units. During the course of the inquiry, the Committee discovered that the demand for housing significantly outweighed the resources necessary to compliment the demand.

However, the Committee noted the various initiatives implemented by the MHUD and the Housing Development Corporation in an effort to not only provide housing, but also empower citizens with the tools needed to embark upon home ownership on their own. The Committee's biggest concern was that of gang infiltration at housing developments, the demand for housing and the Ministry's ability to appropriately monitor and evaluate the construction, maintenance and refurbishment of state- owned or state-funded housing projects and units. The Committee was hopeful the adoption of its proposed recommendations would lead to greater efficiency in the construction, maintenance and refurbishment of State-Owned or State-Funded Housing Projects and Units.

13. The Fifteenth Report¹⁴ of the PAAC on the examination of the expenditure and internal controls of the Ministry of Tourism was laid in the HOR on January 18, 2019 and Senate on January 21, 2021

The PAAC conducted an examination into the Ministry of Tourism (MOT) with particular reference to the Accountability and Transparency, Recurrent Expenditure, Development Programme – Consolidated Fund, Infrastructure Development Fund, and recommendations from the PAAC's Third Report on Inventory Control, Fourth Report on Internal Audit, and Monthly Expenditure Report for the period October – December 2017.

¹³ Office of the Parliament website, *Fourteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20190111, Fourteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee - Construction, Maintenance and Refurbishment of State-Owned Housing Projects \(tparliament.org\)](https://tparliament.org/20190111/Fourteenth-Report-of-the-Public-Administration-and-Appropriations-Committee-Construction-Maintenance-and-Refurbishment-of-State-Owned-Housing-Projects)

¹⁴ Office of the Parliament website, *Fifteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20190118, Fifteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee - Ministry of Tourism \(tparliament.org\)](https://tparliament.org/20190118/Fifteenth-Report-of-the-Public-Administration-and-Appropriations-Committee-Ministry-of-Tourism)

Through the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues such as:

- responses received from the Ministry;
- issues arising from the submission of quarterly reports;
- overseas travel;
- the Auditor General Report 2017; and
- the operationalisation of the Tourism Trinidad Destination Management Company Limited.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater accountability, transparency and value for money in the product offered by the MOT and entities under its purview.

14. The Sixteenth Report¹⁵ of the PAAC on the examination into the implementation of the Public Sector Investment Programme (PSIP) was laid in the HOR on January 25, 2019 and Senate on January 29, 2019

The PAAC conducted an inquiry into the Implementation of the PSIP. Throughout the course of the inquiry, the Committee discovered that the Ministry of Planning and Development (MPD) was experiencing difficulty in carrying out its duty to monitor the planning and implementation of the PSIP. There were over forty-three (43) vacancies and nine hundred and ninety-two (992) projects on the 2017/2018 PSIP which were supervised by fifteen (15) officers at the MPD. Additionally, the untimely releases or unavailability of funds was another potentially crippling hindrance but in an effort to advance projects some Ministries have the scope of works to meet the funds given.

The Committee's biggest concern was the poor planning and implementation of projects which was a consequence of the lack of the requisite manpower and skillset in the Public Service. As such, the Committee intends to continuously monitor the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

¹⁵ Office of the Parliament website, *Sixteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20190125, 16th Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee - PSIP \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20190125/16th-Report-of-the-Public-Administration-and-Appropriations-Committee-PSIP)

15. The Seventeenth Report¹⁶ of the PAAC on the examination into the expenditure and internal controls of the East Port of Spain Development Company Limited (EPOSDCL) was laid in the House of Representatives (HOR) on September 9, 2019 and Senate on September 11, 2019

During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues such as:

- response received from the line Ministry and EPOSDCL;
- issues ranging from the Forensic Audit;
- unaudited Financial Statements;
- appointment of Board Members; and
- oversight by MHUD and Projects undertaken were discussed.

Throughout its deliberations the Committee noted a number of deficiencies. One particular issue was an apparent lack of stringent internal controls. Furthermore, the Committee was of the view that the absence of a Strategic Plan has resulted in a lack of guiding policies and strategies which has negatively impacted the organisation.

While it was commendable that the Company could operate in “high risk” communities without any incident of violence, the lack of internal controls hinders the optimal realisation of the Company’s limited resources. Greater oversight should be exercised by the line Ministry, the MHUD to ensure greater efficiencies. Further the Monitoring and Evaluation system employed by the Company was admittedly deficient and therefore its results may not be reliable indicators of the Company’s performance.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater accountability, transparency and value for money in the use of public funds by EPOSDCL. Moreover, the Committee intends to monitor the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

¹⁶ Office of the Parliament website, *Seventeenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20190909, Seventeenth \(17th\) Report of the PAAC - East Port of Spain Development Company Limited \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20190909/Seventeenth%20(17th)%20Report%20of%20the%20PAAC%20-%20East%20Port%20of%20Spain%20Development%20Company%20Limited)

16. The Eighteenth Report¹⁷ of the PAAC A report on the examination of the Statements of Expenditure for the first, second and third quarters as well as the month ending July 31st of the financial year 2018/2019, with respect to Recurrent Expenditure and Development Programme - Consolidated Fund and Infrastructure Development Fund. was laid in the HOR on September 20, 2019 and Senate on September 25, 2019

In support of the PAAC's mandate to monitor the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies as it occurs; and to keep Parliament informed of how the budget allocation was implemented, the Committee engaged in quarterly tracking of the expenditure of all M&E during the Fourth Session of the Eleventh Parliament. The Statements of Expenditure information were received for the first, second and third quarters of fiscal 2019, as well as the month ending July 31, 2019. This data was presented to the House to illustrate the spending patterns of Government agencies over during fiscal 2019. The Committee intends to continuously monitor the budgetary expenditure of Government agencies in the next session and beyond.

Fourth Session

17. The Nineteenth Report¹⁸ of the PAAC on the examination of the expenditure and internal controls of the Ministry of Works and Transport was laid in the HOR on November 22, 2019 and Senate November 26, 2019.

Based on the evidence received, issues surrounding accountability and transparency, the Ministerial Response to the Third Report on Inventory Control, the Ministerial Response to the Fourth Report on Internal Audit, Sub - Head 02 - Goods and Services, Sub - Head 06 - Current Transfers of Statutory Boards and Similar Bodies, Sub - Head 04 - Current Transfers and Subsidies, Sub - Head 09 - Development Programme - Consolidated Fund, and Infrastructure Development Fund were discussed such as:

- outstanding payments owed for URP projects;

¹⁷ Office of the Parliament website, *Eighteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20180925_18th_Report - PAAC - Examination of Statements of Expenditure \(tparliament.org\)](https://tparliament.org/20180925_18th_Report_-_PAAC_-_Examination_of_Statements_of_Expenditure)

¹⁸ Office of the Parliament website, *Nineteenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20191122, Nineteenth \(19th\) Report of the PAAC - Ministry of Works and Transport \(tparliament.org\)](https://tparliament.org/20191122_Nineteenth_(19th)_Report_of_the_PAAC_-_Ministry_of_Works_and_Transport)

- non-compliance with the existing rules, systems, and procedures at the Ministry which was recorded in monthly Compliance;
- Audit Reports done by the Finance and Accounts Division;
- Vacancies in Units such as (PURE) and the Internal Audit; and
- the cost incurred by the State to remove wrecked and derelict vessels that were stranded and/or abandoned in the Port of Spain Harbour and the Sea Lots area.

The Committee discovered that there were instances in which contractors failed to meet their contract requirements which resulted in a breach of contract. The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater accountability, transparency and value for money in the use of public funds by Ministry. Moreover, the Committee intends to monitor the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

18. The Twentieth Report¹⁹ of the PAAC on an examination into the approval process for land use in Trinidad and Tobago was laid in the HOR on December 6, 2019 and Senate on December 7, 2019

The PAAC conducted an inquiry into the approval process for land use in Trinidad and Tobago. The objective of the Inquiry was to examine the policies in place to guide the approval process for land use, the systems in place to monitor all levels (residential, industrial, commercial & agricultural) of developments, and to determine the capacity of state agencies responsible for monitoring land development.

During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on several issues from the written responses received from the Town and Country Planning Division (TCPD) of the MPD and the Ministry of Rural Development and Local Government (MRDLG). Issues arising such as:

- unauthorised development;
- staff constraints in both the TCPD and the MRDLG; and

¹⁹ Office of the Parliament website, *Twentieth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: <http://www.ttparliament.org/reports/p11-s5-J-20191206-PAAC-R20.pdf>

- the absence of an updated National Development Plan were discussed. It appears that the universal factor hampering all agencies involved was one of having an adequate work force particularly in the skilled and technical points.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater improvement in the services offered by the TCPD of the MPD and the MRDLG. The Committee intends to monitor the progress subsequent to the implementation of the recommendations by the entities as proposed.

19. The Twenty-First Report²⁰ of the PAAC on an inquiry into the oversight of State Agencies under the purview of the MOE and funding to Private Secondary School Institutions was laid in the HOR on December 6, 2019 and Senate December 7, 2019.

During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues from the responses received from the MOE such as:

- issues arising from the oversight by the Ministry;
- outstanding financial statements; and
- reporting, project management and the rationalisation of state agencies.

Throughout its deliberations, the Committee discovered that there were a number of staff shortages and ineffective oversight of state agencies under the Ministry's purview. The Ministry's biggest challenge was outstanding financial statements from its agencies and the Ministry's inability to ensure all statements and reports were submitted on time. Additionally, the Committee was of the view that the lack of a Monitoring and Evaluation Unit led to the absence of guiding policies and strategies which negatively impacted the Ministry's oversight role.

However, it appears that there was a functioning and adequate reporting mechanism. The Committee considers that greater oversight should be given by the MOE over the State

²⁰ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-First Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20191206, Twenty-First \(21st\) Report of the PAAC - Oversight of MOE agencies and funding to Private Secondary Schools \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20191206/Twenty-First(21st)ReportofthePAAC-OversightofMOEagenciesandfundingtoPrivateSecondarySchools)

Agencies under its purview. The Committee proposes that consideration can be given to delegating oversight roles to other Departments within the Ministry to enhance efficiencies. The Committee intends to monitor the progress subsequent to the implementation of the recommendations by the entities as proposed.

20. The Twenty-Second Report²¹ of the PAAC on the examination of the expenditure and internal controls of the Trinidad and Tobago Police Service (TTPS) for the financial year 2018-2019 was laid in the HOR on March 25, 2020 and Senate on March 26, 2020.

Based on the evidence received, issues surrounding accountability, transparency and arising from Sub - Head 02 - Goods and Services; Sub - Head 06 - Current Transfers of Stat. Boards and Similar Bodies; Sub – Head 04 – Current Transfers and Subsidies; Sub – Head 09 - Development Programme – Consolidated Fund; and Infrastructure Development Fund were discussed. Issues surrounding the absence of a Police Headquarters, the untimely release of funds from the MOF, staff and resource constraints were discussed. It was also noted that improper driving practices by police officers have resulted in the loss of and rapid wear and tear of police vehicles.

The Committee further noted the number of police officers on indefinite suspension that was still in receipt of their monthly salary. The Committee discovered that the COP has little input in the construction of new police stations. The Committee intends to monitor the progress subsequent to the implementation of the recommendations by the Department as proposed

21. The Twenty-Third Report²² of the PAAC on an examination into the expenditure and internal controls of the Ministry of Communications for the fiscal year 2018/2019 was laid in the HOR on March 25, 2020 and Senate on March 26, 2020

The PAAC conducted an inquiry into the expenditure and internal controls of the MOC for the fiscal year 2018/2019. During the course of the examination which consisted of written

²¹ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Second Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20200325, Twenty-Second \(22nd\) Report of the PAAC - Trinidad and Tobago Police Service \(TTPS\) \(ttparliament.org\)](https://ttparliament.org/20200325-Twenty-Second-(22nd)-Report-of-the-PAAC-Trinidad-and-Tobago-Police-Service-(TTPS))

²² Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Third Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20200325, Twenty-Third \(23rd\) Report of the PAAC - Ministry of Communications \(ttparliament.org\)](https://ttparliament.org/20200325-Twenty-Third-(23rd)-Report-of-the-PAAC-Ministry-of-Communications)

submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on several issues from the written responses received from the Ministry were discussed such as:

- staff constraints;
- the absence of an approved organisational structure and Procurement Unit; and
- outstanding payments for projects and internal audit.

It appears that the universal factor hampering the operations of the Ministry was one of inadequate staff. The Committee noted that the Ministry was making every attempt to address the issues facing the Ministry since the separation. The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater efficiency at the Ministry. Moreover, the Committee intends to monitor the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed.

Fifth Session

22. The Twenty-Eighth Report²³ of the PAAC on an examination into the maintenance of Community Pools by the MSYA was laid in the HOR on July 3,2020 and Senate on July 2, 2020.

The PAAC conducted an examination into the maintenance of Community Pools by the MSYA. During the course of the examination, the Committee learnt of issues surrounding the maintenance of Community Swimming Pools, the challenges encountered and details related to the arrears owed to essential service providers. The Committee's biggest concern was the lack of funding to assist in the easing of these issues. The Committee noted that, in spite of the constant communication with the MOF, funding was still delayed which interrupted the use and maintenance of the facilities.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater efficiency of Community Swimming Pools.

²³ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Eighth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021:

23. The Twenty-Ninth Report²⁴ of the PAAC on the examination into the delivery of projects and programmes by the Ministry of Social Development and Family Services. was laid in the HOR on July 3,2020 and Senate on July 2, 2020.

During the Fifth Session of the Eleventh Parliament, the PAAC conducted an examination into the delivery of projects and programmes by the MSDFS. During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on several issues from the written responses received from the MSDFS such as:

- the Social Services Client Management System;
- Information and Communications Technology;
- staffing issues in various Units;
- accountability and transparency ;and the challenges faced with the management of projects and programmes.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater efficiency into the delivery of projects and programmes.

24. The Thirtieth Report²⁵ of the PAAC on the examination into the preparedness and response of public authorities to the COVID-19 Pandemic in Trinidad and Tobago was laid in the HOR on July 3,2020 and Senate on July 2, 2020.

It was the hope of the Committee that the work conducted throughout this inquiry would provide the foundation for further examination of and reporting on the preparedness and response of public authorities to the COVID-19 pandemic in Trinidad and Tobago in the Twelfth Parliament. As such, a continuation of this inquiry was conducted in the First session, Twelfth Parliament.

Moreover, The Committee intends to continue to monitor the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed going forward.

²⁴ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Ninth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee* , accessed on August 16,2021:

²⁵ Office of the Parliament website, *Thirtieth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee* , accessed on August 16,2021: [20200702. Thirtieth \(30th\) Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee on an examination into the preparedness and response of public authorities to the COVID-19 pandemic in Trinidad and Tobago \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20200702-Thirtieth-(30th)-Report-of-the-Public-Administration-and-Appropriations-Committee-on-an-examination-into-the-preparedness-and-response-of-public-authorities-to-the-COVID-19-pandemic-in-Trinidad-and-Tobago)

25. The Thirty-First Report²⁶ of the PAAC on the examination into the internal controls and expenditure of the Elections and Boundaries Commission (002 Election Expenses) was laid in the HOR on July 3, 2020 and Senate on July 2, 2020.

The PAAC conducted an inquiry into the internal controls and expenditure of the Elections and Boundaries Commission (002 Election Expenses). During the course of the examination, the Committee learned of the major challenges faced by the EBC and also its Internal Audit Unit specifically.

Furthermore, the Committee noted the lack of an updated Strategic Plan, the non-institutionalisation of the EBC's Comprehensive Risk Management Policy and the human resource issue faced by the EBC.

The PAAC anticipates that another Committee in the Twelfth Parliament would continue the examination into the internal controls and expenditure of the Elections and Boundaries Commission (002 Election Expenses) and follow up on the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed in this Report.

²⁶ Office of the Parliament website, *Thirty-First Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021:

Follow-up Inquiries

Third Session

- 1. The Ninth Report²⁷ of the PAAC on a follow - up examination of the Ministry of Public Utilities – to the Committee’s First and Third Reports as well as the Ministry’s Statement of Expenditure as at October, 2017 was laid in the HOR on March 2, 2018 and Senate on March 6, 2018.**

The PAAC conducted a follow-up inquiry into the Ministry of Public Utilities with particular reference to:

- the recommendations from the PAAC’s First and Third Reports and the corresponding Ministerial Responses; and
- the Ministry’s Statement of Expenditure as at October, 2017.

During the course of the follow-up, the Committee noted that the Ministry had considered its recommendations and were in the implementation phase. Additionally, new issues such as, WASA’s litigation, the repair works by the Water and Resource Management Unit and the lack of advertising of the Utilities Assistance Programme arose.

The Committee underscores the role of continuous monitoring of the implementation of its recommendations and appreciates the value of this in the discharge of its mandate.

- 2. The Tenth Report²⁸ of the PAAC on the examination into the Inventory Control and Internal Audit Systems within the Public Service with specific reference to Follow-up to the Third and Fourth Reports of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee was laid in the HOR on March 21, 2018 and Senate on March 13, 2018.**

During the course of the follow-up to this report, the Committee discovered that the stakeholders were experiencing difficulty in implementing some of the Committee’s recommendations whereas other stakeholders adequately implemented same. The Committee’s biggest concern continues to be the Public Financial Management Reform

²⁷ Office of the Parliament website, *Ninth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20180302, Ninth \(9th\) Report of the PAAC - Ministry of Public Utilities \(ttparliament.org\)](https://ttparliament.org/20180302)

²⁸ Office of the Parliament website, *Tenth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16,2021: [20180321, 10th Report of the PAAC - Inventory Control and Internal Audit Systems \(ttparliament.org\)](https://ttparliament.org/20180321)

initiative being undertaken by the MOF due to the fact that the initiative has the potential to solve many of the pervasive issues highlighted in the Committee's Report.

The Committee will continue to follow up on the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed in this Report

Fourth Session

3. The Twenty-Fourth Report²⁹ of the PAAC on the examination into the Processing of Payment of Pension and Gratuity to Retired Public Officers and Contracted Employees - Follow-up was laid in the HOR on May 8, 2020 and Senate on May 1, 2020.

During the Third and Fourth Session of the Eleventh Parliament, the PAAC conducted inquiries into the Processing of Payment of Pensions and Gratuities to Retired Public Officers and Contracted Employees. During the course of the inquiry, the Committee discovered that the stakeholders were experiencing difficulty in carrying out their statutory obligation i.e. to ensure that pensions are treated as a matter of urgency.

The Committee's biggest concern was the backlog of persons yet to receive their pensions and gratuities and the timely payment of same to persons approaching retirement. Subsequent to the presentation of the Interim Report and the second Public Hearing, the Committee noted improvements made by stakeholders. Policies and plans intended to decrease inefficiencies with regard to the payments of pensions and gratuities were revealed.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to the timely payment of pension and gratuity to retired Public Officers and Contracted Employees.

4. The Twenty-Fifth Report³⁰ of the PAAC on an examination into the Development Programme for fiscal year 2018/2019 and follow-up on the Ministerial Response to

²⁹ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Fourth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20200501, Twenty-Fourth \(24th\) Report of the PAAC - Processing of Payment of Pension and Gratuity to Retired Public Officers and Contracted Employees \(tparliament.org\)](#)

³⁰ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Fifth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20200501, Twenty-Fifth \(25th\) Report of the PAAC - Tobago House of Assembly \(THA\) \(tparliament.org\)](#)

the Sixth Report on the Tobago House of Assembly (THA) was laid in the HOR on May 8, 2020 and Senate on May 1, 2020

The PAAC conducted an examination into the THA's Development Programme for fiscal year 2018/2019 as well as follow-up on the Ministerial Response to the Sixth Report on the THA. During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on several issues from the written responses received from the THA. The reallocation and redistribution of the allocation received from Parliament and the impact of the staff structure and staff constraints on the day-to-day operations of the THA were examined.

The Committee noted the absence of Monitoring and Evaluation Units in various Divisions and the need to fill vacant positions in the Procurement Units. The Committee further noted that there was a need to update the THA's Divisional Strategic and Operational Plans and the Competitive Economic Development Plan for Tobago. The issue of the non adherence by State Enterprises under the purview of the THA to their reporting obligations as stated in the State Enterprises Performance Monitoring Manual was examined as well the delay in projects and the status of the investigation of the missing \$10 million from the THA. The Committee will continue to follow up on the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed in this Report

5. The Twenty-Sixth Report³¹ of the PAAC on a follow-up examination based on the Ministerial Response from stakeholders to the Twelfth Report on the Administration of Disaster Relief in Trinidad and Tobago was laid in the HOR on May 8, 2020 and Senate on May 1, 2020.

The PAAC conducted a follow-up examination into the Administration of Disaster Relief in Trinidad and Tobago. During the course of the examination which consisted of written submissions and a Public Hearing, the Committee followed up on a number of issues from the ministerial responses received from stakeholders in relation to the Twelfth Report on the Administration of Disaster Relief in Trinidad and Tobago. During the course of the

³¹ Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Sixth Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20200701, Twenty-Sixth \(26th\) Report of the PAAC - Administration of Disaster Relief \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20200701/20200701-Twenty-Sixth-26th-Report-of-the-PAAC-Administration-of-Disaster-Relief)

examinations the Committee discovered that stakeholders were still experiencing difficulties with staffing and insufficient funds to effectively and efficiently monitor and stay ahead of the fast-approaching climate change.

However, the Committee noted the improvements made with the development and implementation of new plans and initiatives to assist the stakeholders to carry out their respective mandates in spite of its challenges.

The Committee was of the view that the adoption of its proposed recommendations will lead to greater efficiency and effectiveness in the administration of disaster relief and also stronger coordinated responses in the event of disasters.

6. The Twenty-Seventh Report³² of the PAAC on the follow-up examination into the expenditure and internal controls of the Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs was laid in the HOR on July 3, 2020 and Senate on July 2, 2020.

The Committee noted that the issues experienced by the MSYA and the entities under its purview were a result of a combination of insufficient resource allocations and inefficient management of its limited resources.

Systems to monitor and evaluate expenditure seem to be a particularly weak point of the Ministry. The Committee will continue to follow up on the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations proposed in this Report

³² Office of the Parliament website, *Twenty-Seventh Report of the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee*, accessed on August 16, 2021: [20200701, Twenty-Seventh \(27th\) Report of the PAAC - Ministry of Sport and Youth Affairs \(ttparliament.org\)](https://www.ttparliament.org/20200701/Twenty-Seventh-(27th)-Report-of-the-PAAC-Ministry-of-Sport-and-Youth-Affairs)

Pervasive Issues

During the Eleventh Parliament a number of pervasive issues were identified to be rectified across Ministries, Departments and State Enterprises. Emanating from the examination, the following pervasive issues were identified:

Internal Audit

During the Committee's deliberations it was discovered that the Internal Audit Unit at a number of Government agencies required strengthening as a result of:

- lack of expertise and qualifications;
- lack of staffing; and
- lack of training of Internal Audit staff.

There were existing issues of the failure to fill vacancies and an ineffective audit processes. At times it was observed that the Internal Audit staff were performing other administrative functions which posed as a hindrance to effectively performing their assigned duties.

Monitoring and Evaluation

The non-existence of a Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Unit was observed to be a pattern throughout Government Agencies. A number of issues were identified such as:

- an understaffed M&E Units;
- absence of a M&E framework; and
- admittedly deficient M&E systems which resulted in unreliable indicators of the agency's performance.

It was determined that the absence of an M&E Unit led to a lack of guiding policies and strategies which negatively impacted the oversight and accountability mechanisms at Government Agencies.

Lack of the implementation of Projects from the Public Sector Investment Programme (PSIP)

In many instances, there was a lack of implementation of the PSIP. The Committee identified the following issues:

- A major part of the Ministry's allocation was provided for its projects and programmes. The effective implementation of the projects and programmes were hindered by a number of factors. These include:
 - a lack of timely releases;
 - various issues with contractors, such as, delays or non-payments leading to time-wasting; and
 - the stalling of projects.
- The implementation of the PSIP was also hampered by the slow processes both internally and externally. The Committee learned that the management of relationships between internal and external stakeholders were not always within the stipulated time of the project or programme therefore creating unnecessary delays.; and
- The Project Implementation Unit was understaffed or non-existent which played a major role in the lack of implementation of the PSIP.

- **Non-existence of relationships amongst Ministries and Departments**

The lack of coordination and the non-existence of relationships amongst M&Ds delayed the functions and operations as some processes within M&Ds involves the assistance of another. For example, approvals and authorisations needed for the completion of various tasks in M&Ds. The untimely approvals/authorisations led to a major delay in the functions of the M&Ds affecting its service. The Committee concluded that the relationship between M&Ds needed to be strengthened in order to carry out its purpose effectively.

- **Lack of the use of Information Communications Technology (ICT)**

Over the last decade, ICT has become an important tool to provide quicker ways for interaction, networking and the sharing and storing of information. Although there were a number of Government Agencies that were on the path to strengthening its ICT systems, a number of challenges were encountered such as:

- lack of the use of systems in place;
- vacancies within the existing Units at Agencies;
- lack of ICT Security Policy and ICT Strategic Plan; and

- incomplete applications/systems that prevented some entities from having a strong online presence through its website, social media (Facebook, etc.). This has grown overtime to be an important tool whereby entities can edify and inform the public.

3. CONCLUSION

Throughout the Eleventh Parliament, the Public Administration and Appropriations Committee (PAAC) set out to ensure the achievement of its mandate by identifying the hindrances of M&Ds and making recommendations to the Government for improvement of public administration. This was completed via the steps taken in the Committee's inquiry process which allowed for the continuous oversight of the financial and administrative performance of Government agencies in real time.

During the course of its examinations which consisted of written submissions, Public Hearings and current issues, the Committee discovered a number of pervasive issues that once addressed should improve the efficiencies within Government agencies.

Additionally, the Committee in its oversight role, conducted follow-up inquiries with agencies which exhibited the highest incidents of pervasive issues. This approach gave the Committee an opportunity to monitor the status of the implementation of recommendations, as well as any new plans and updates of agencies.

The Committee is of the view that the adoption of this approach in the Twelfth Parliament will lead to greater accountability, transparency and value for money in the use of public funds amongst Government agencies. Moreover, the Committee intends to monitor the progress made in the Eleventh Parliament and the implementation of its recommendations proposed in the Twelfth Parliament.

APPENDIX 1

Attendance Register

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoë	Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Ms. Allyson Baksh	Ms. Melissa Ramkisoorn	Dr. Dhanyshar Mahabir	Ms. Jennifer Raffoul	Mr. Ronald Huggins	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine
First Meeting 27.01.2016	√	√	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	√	√	√				
Second Meeting 10.02.2016	√	√	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	√	√				
Third Meeting 24.02.2016	√	Excused	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√				
Fourth Meeting 21.03.2016	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	Excused				
Fifth Meeting 13.04.2016	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√				
Sixth Meeting 27.04.2016	√	√	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	√	√				
Seventh Meeting 11.05.2016	√	√	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	√	√				
Eight Meeting 08.06.2016	√	√	Excused	√	√	√	√	Excused	√	√				

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoie	Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Ms. Allyson Baksh	Ms. Melissa Ramkisoan	Dr. Dhanyshar Mahabir	Ms. Jennifer Raffoul	Mr. Ronald Huggins	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine
Ninth Meeting 15.06.2016	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	Excused	√	√				
Tenth Meeting 22.06.2016	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	Excused				
Eleventh Meeting 13.07.2016	√	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	Absent	√	√				
Twelfth Meeting 15.09.2016	√	Excused	Excused	√	√	√	√	√	√	√				
Thirteenth Meeting 16.11.2016	√	√	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	Excused				
Fourteenth Meeting 30.11.2016	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	Excused				
Fifteenth Meeting 14.12.2016	Excused	√	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	√				

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoë	Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Ms. Allyson Baksh	Ms. Melissa Ramkisoon	Dr. Dhanyshar Mahabir	Ms. Jennifer Raffoul	Mr. Ronald Huggins	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine
Sixteenth Meeting 12.01.2017	√	√	Excused	√	√	√	√	√	√		√			
Seventeenth Meeting 25.01.2017	√	√	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	√		√			
Eighteenth Meeting 08.02.2017	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	Absent	√		Excused			
Nineteenth Meeting 15.02.2017	√	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	√	Absent	√		Excused			
Twentieth Meeting 08.03.2017	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	√		√			
Twenty-First Meeting 23.03.2017	√	Excused	√	√	√	√	√	Excused	√		Excused			
Twenty-Second Meeting 20.04.2017	√	√	√	√	√	√	Excused	Excused	√		Excused			

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoe	Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Ms. Allyson Baksh	Ms. Melissa Ramkisoorn	Dr. Dhanyshar Mahabir	Ms. Jennifer Raffoul	Mr. Ronald Huggins	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine
Twenty-Third Meeting 27.04.2017	√	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	Excused	√		√			
Twenty-Fourth Meeting 05.06.2017	√	√	Excused	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	Excused		Excused			
Twenty-Fifth Meeting 03.07.2017	√	√	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	√		Excused			
Twenty-Sixth Meeting 11.09.2017	√	√	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	Excused		Excused			
Twenty-Seventh Meeting 13.12.2017	√	√	√	Excused		√	Excused	Excused				√	√	√
Twenty-Eighth Meeting 28.12.2017	√	Excused	Excused	√		√	Excused	Excused				√	√	√
Twenty-Ninth Meeting 17.1.2018	√	Excused	√	Excused		Excused	Excused	√				Excused	√	Excused
Thirtieth Meeting 31.1.2018	√	√	√	Excused		√	√	√				√	Excused	√

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoie	Mrs. Ayanna Webster-Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Maxie Cuffie	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Ms. Allyson Baksh	Ms. Melissa Ramkisoorn	Dr. Dhanyshar Mahabir	Ms. Jennifer Raffoul	Mr. Ronald Huggins	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine
Thirty – First Meeting 31.02.2018	Excused	√	√	Excused		Excused	Excused	√				Excused	Excused	√
Thirty-Second Meeting 28.02.2018	√	√	√	Excused		Excused	√	Excused				√	Excused	√
Thirty-Third Meeting 18.04.2018	√	Excused	√	Excused		√	√	√				Excused	√	√
Thirty-Fourth Meeting 25.04.2018	√	Excused	Excused	Excused		√	√	Excused				Excused	Excused	Excused
Thirty-Fifth Meeting 09.05.2018	√	√	Excused	√		√	Excused	Excused				√	Excused	√
Thirty-Sixth Meeting 16.05.2018	√	Excused	Excused	Excused		Excused	Excused	√				Excused	Excused	√
Thirty-Seventh Meeting 13.06.2018	√	√	√	Excused		Excused	Excused	√				Excused	Excused	√
Thirty-Eight Meeting 11.07.2018	√	Excused	√	Excused		Excused	Excused	√				Excused	Excused	√
Thirty-Ninth Meeting 25.09.2018	√	√	√	Excused		√	Excused	Excused				Excused	Excused	√

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoë	Mrs. Ayanna Webster- Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine	Ms. Amrita Deonarine	Mr. Garvin Simonette
Fortieth Meeting 09.01.2019	√	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	Excused
Forty- First Meeting 23.01.2019	√	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	√	√	√
Forty- Second Meeting 13.02.2019	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	√
Forty- Third Meeting 20.02.2019	√	Excused	√	√	√	√	√	Excused	√	Excused
Forty- Fourth Meeting 13.03.2019	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	√	√	√
Forty- Fifth Meeting 28.03.2019	√	√	Excused	Excused	√	√	Absent	Excused	√	Excused

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoé	Mrs. Ayanna Webster- Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine	Ms. Amrita Deonarine	Mr. Garvin Simonette
Forty-Sixth Meeting 10.04.2019	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	√	Excused	√
Forty-Seventh Meeting 22.05.2019	√	Excused	Excused	Absent	√	Excused	√	Absent	√	Excused
Forty-Eight Meeting 29.05.2019	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	Excused
Forty-Ninth Meeting 18.09.2019	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	√	√	

PAAC ATTENDANCE REGISTER

Meetings	Ms. Bridgid Annisette – George	Dr. Lackram Bodoë	Mrs. Ayanna Webster- Roy	Ms. Nicole Olivierre	Ms. Amrita Deonarine	Mr. Wade Mark	Mr. Daniel Dookie	Mr. Clarence Rambharat	Brig. Gen Ancil Antoine	Mr. Foster Cummings
Fiftieth Meeting 13.11.2019	√	Excused	√	Excused	√	√	Absent	Excused	√	Absent
Fifty-First Meeting 05.02.2020	√	√	Excused	√	√	Excused	√	Excused	Excused	√
Fifty-Second Meeting 12.02.2020	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	√	Excused	Excused	√	Excused
Fifty-Third Meeting 11.03.2020	√	√	√	Absent	√	Absent	Absent	Absent	√	Excused
Fifty-Fourth Meeting 21.05.2020	√	Excused	Excused	Excused	√	√	√	Excused	Absent	Absent

- Mr. Foster Cummings replaced Mr. Garvin Simonette with effect from October 25, 2019